

Path Selection for Sustainable Regional Economic Development: The Transformation Experience of Colorado, USA, and Strategies for Economic Revitalization in Northeast China

Cong Gao, Jiabin Zhu *

Graduate School, Harbin Sport University, Harbin, Heilongjiang, 150008, China

* Corresponding author: Jiabin Zhu

Abstract: Economic revitalization in Liaoning, Jilin, and Heilongjiang involves renewing an established industrial base while developing other sources of production and income. This paper, which is based on literature, explores that issue as well as Colorado's diversification from mining and agriculture, through the lenses of theories of regional transformation and sustainable development. The comparison is done on the basis of industrial upgrading, private investment, resource utilization and research commercialization. Colorado's technology sector represents the ties between businesses, investment and research institutions, while renewable energy and tourism offer alternative applications of natural resources. Within Northeast China, the analysis makes a distinction between technological innovation in the coal, steel, petroleum, and machinery sectors and the growth of other industries. The analysis proceeds along four lines of inquiry: government support and policy coordination, industrial innovation, cooperation across regions, and clean energy and services. The result is an understanding of the development choices that firms have that can be matched by their resources and capabilities. It is a qualitative comparison, NOT an estimate of policy effects or evidence of being able to replicate Colorado's experience in the three provinces.

Keywords: Northeast China Economic Revitalization; Colorado; Industrial Diversification; Technological Innovation; Sustainable Development.

1. Introduction

Coal, steel, petroleum, and machinery offer the industrial foundation for Liaoning, Jilin, and Heilongjiang. The economic change in these provinces is one of fitting new production into old production systems and accommodating new production. The wider setting is discussed in research on changes in the international economy and industrial upgrading [1,2]. Digitalization brings questions about technology adoption and market regulation [3]. For economies with a history of extraction, resource depletion and environmental damage are further constraints on restructuring [4].

An increase in output can leave these underlying pressures unresolved. Work on China's transition toward high-quality development examines economic management [5], and studies of the international economy describe the longer-term setting for structural change [6]. At the regional level, employment and social conditions also matter, as does the continuing availability of local resources [7]. The pace of growth is therefore only part of the development problem.

Two strands of research address aspects of Northeast China's transition: the commercialization of scientific and technological achievements [8], and the relationship between industrial structure and urban-rural income differences [9]. They focus attention on the way in which knowledge enters production and on the way in which the composition of production is connected to social conditions. In the current paper, the concept of industrial restructuring is placed on the same footing as investment, innovation, and the utilisation of ecological resources. It still focuses on the three provinces, their combined productive assets and their technical

knowledge.

Colorado supplies the comparison. The case relates to the mining and agriculture heritage and, later, its diversification into technology industries, clean energy, and tourism, in relation to the development questions posed for Northeast China. The study is qualitative, literature-based, and based on the theories of regional transformation and sustainable development. The two regional accounts are contrasted and their implications and potential development options are discussed.

2. Theoretical Review

2.1. Regional Economic Transformation

Regional transformation not only alters the composition of production, but also the way that firms function. Not only can new industries be created, but existing companies can also modify their products, production processes, or market position along a supply chain. Industrial restructuring, technological change and resource efficiency are therefore interrelated aspects of transformation [10]. A region's departure from resource dependence need not be confined to the creation of new sectors.

Industrial upgrading, as discussed in the global value-chain literature, involves movement toward activities with greater value added [11]. Firms may acquire technology and capital from elsewhere, yet their ability to use those resources depends on local learning. Turkina and Van Assche examine the relationship between global connections and innovation within industrial clusters [12]. This distinction between acquiring resources and developing capabilities is relevant to both new businesses and existing manufacturers.

Structural adjustment has a horizontal dimension when the

balance between industries changes. The vertical dimension has to do with the extension or reorganization of an industrial chain. In Northeast China, these dimensions include the expansion of other industries and modifications within existing production. Market structure, public investment and institutional structures determine the way in which firms acquire inputs and organise these activities.

Innovation-driven development addresses the creation and application of knowledge [13]. Schumpeter's theory links economic development to changes in products, production methods, and business organization [14]; Li and colleagues examine digital transformation and innovation performance within firms [15]. Regional analysis extends beyond the innovative firm to its relationships with researchers, investors, and skilled workers. Those relationships are relevant to understanding how knowledge reaches other parts of the economy.

2.2. Economic Theories of Sustainable Development

The issue of intergenerational equity in sustainable development is highlighted in resource extraction: income provided today will lead to a decrease in a natural resource stock in the future. Industrial activity may also offer employment opportunities at the expense of the environment. Whether investment and technology can compensate for such losses is a central difference between weak and strong sustainability.

Weak sustainability allows losses of natural capital to be offset by increases in human-made capital [16]. Strong sustainability limits this substitution because some natural assets and ecological functions cannot be replaced [17]. For a resource-based region, the distinction affects how industrial change is understood. Investment can change what is produced and how resources are used – but it does not necessarily reverse all of the environmental damage that has happened as a result of past investment.

The Environmental Kuznets Curve describes a proposed rise and subsequent fall in some forms of environmental pressure as income increases [18]. The relationship depends on the activity measured and the circumstances of environmental improvement; it does not make improvement an inevitable result of growth. Green growth attempts to solve the issue by looking at resource efficiency, renewables, recycling and low carbon technology. These ideas allow the economic and environmental impacts to be considered simultaneously, without assuming a direct connection between increased output and environmental sustainability.

3. Colorado's Economic Transformation

3.1. Historical Background

Colorado's nineteenth-century gold and silver mining drew migrants and capital to the Rocky Mountains. In the plains wheat and corn farming emerged, and so did livestock farming, including cattle. The state's subsequent diversification began with resources provided by mining and agriculture. However, the presence of natural resources continued to play its role in the economy while technology industries, renewable energy, and tourism expanded the spectrum of activities. That role also shifted: the mountain terrain for recreation plays a different production-support role from a mineral deposit used for extraction. The Colorado case

is examined as a broadening of economic activity rather than a complete departure from resource-related production.

3.2. Policy Support and the Role of Government

Colorado's Advanced Industries Accelerator programs are grants and investment tax credits that focus on commercialization, early-stage financing and public and private partnerships [19]. Their scope spans the development of a technology and its commercial application. They detail the structure of business support in this case, including the infrastructure, research facilities and education offered to companies and research institutions.

Energy supply is addressed through a different set of instruments. In 2004, Colorado enacted a Renewable Energy Standard (RES) that is operated through a voter-led process and Xcel Energy releases plans and compliance reports for renewable energy [20]. The planning and reporting requirements document one part of energy development in the state. Business assistance and energy needs are considered separately here as they cover different activities.

3.3. Private Capital and Innovation

The account of Denver and Boulder places private finance within a network of entrepreneurs, research organizations, and business-support facilities. Colorado's economic development office describes established technology companies and newer firms together with research and industry organizations in its sector profiles [21,22]. Investors participate through the resources they commit to businesses and technology development.

A result of research has to be developed before it can be put on the market. At this juncture, venture finance and incubators come in, along with Colorado's early stage capital and collaborative infrastructure programs [19]. The private investment is explored in terms of the development work on which it is expended and the knowledge firms utilize. That transition to commercial production is not a result of the amount of money raised, alone.

3.4. Clean Energy and the Tertiary Sector

Wind and solar energy give natural resources a role in electricity production. The renewable energy plans for Colorado outline the arrangements with regard to this activity [20]. Alongside it, software and information services, bioscience research, and medical applications extend the economy beyond energy and extraction. State industry profiles are a list of parties that are active in these research and commercial fields [21,22]. Their work draws on specialized skills and facilities as well as the finance needed to bring technologies into use.

Tourism depends on a different combination of resources and services. Aspen and Vail exemplify winter recreation, while skiing, hiking and outdoor activities are included in Colorado's official tourism material [23]. Tourism involves a person who uses local facilities and services as well as the landscape. The natural setting alone is not the entire tourism product. This relationship offers a place to compare against the forests, snow and winter recreation resources in Northeast China.

4. Economic Conditions and Challenges in Northeast China

4.1. Industrial Background

Energy, raw materials, and equipment manufacturing were central to the industrial base described in the 2003 Northeast revitalization document [24]. Coal, petroleum, steel and machinery thus provide the historical context for this paper. The industrial and infrastructural stock built up in these sectors is ripe for renewal, as is technical know-how. Transformation involves the choice of how existing capacity is applied and modernised, as well as the creation of new activities.

Population ageing and the outward migration of younger workers compound the industrial problem through the reduced availability of labour and technical skills. Access to personnel is crucial to both established manufacturers and new companies. These demographic pressures are considered here without assuming that the population or industrial conditions of Liaoning, Jilin, and Heilongjiang are identical.

4.2. Industrial Structure and Resource Dependence

When a regional economy is concentrated in coal, steel, and petroleum, changes in these industries extend beyond individual producers. Coal and steel are sensitive to the influence of capacity, demand and prices, and petroleum is sensitive to energy markets. Environmental costs are associated with resource use. The composition of production is important because it affects the extent to which the regional economy shares these vulnerabilities.

The presence of factories and industrial skills does not remove every obstacle to a new activity. Finance, research links, and commercial capabilities may still be missing. The commercialization of scientific and technological accomplishments in North East China (NEC) helps to solve part of this problem [8]. The development of an emerging industry involves securing resources for its own operations and establishing connections with the region's production, skills, and markets.

4.3. Revitalization Policies

The 2003 Opinions on Implementing the Strategy for Revitalizing Old Industrial Bases in Northeast China and Other Regions covered institutional change and industrial upgrading together with agriculture, services, resource-based cities, infrastructure, and economic cooperation [24]. Its agenda extended beyond heavy industry. The 2016 Opinions on the Comprehensive Revitalization of Old Industrial Bases in Northeast China and Other Regions again addressed institutions, structural adjustment, innovation, and social conditions [25]. Among the problems identified in 2016 were the links between research and production, the development of new industries, and transition in resource-dependent areas.

The documents set the agendas as defined at these dates. They pose the questions relating to enterprise reform and productive capacity, the development of activities outside traditional sectors, the coordination of enterprises among levels of government, and the involvement of private investments. Evidence about the effects of individual measures would be needed to move from these stated objectives to an assessment of policy performance.

4.4. Development Options

Northeast China's options address several constraints on industrial renewal. Research cooperation and technology platforms are mechanisms that allow firms to access knowledge, and entry and investment mechanisms are ways that govern participation in markets. The two problems are not resolved in the same way. Apart from the modernization of industry, agriculture, ecological tourism and clean energy offer other possibilities for the utilization of regional resources. The comparisons to Colorado follow these differences rather than attributing every restriction to a lack of capital.

5. Implications of the Colorado Comparison

5.1. Policy Support and Public Infrastructure

Colorado's programs distinguish early-stage finance, commercialization, and shared infrastructure [19]. This division makes it possible to ask a firm whether it needs help with developing a technology, bringing that technology to market, or using shared facilities. In Northeast China, the question is what the roles of its supporting systems are in relation to those stages. It is not necessary for this level of comparison to think of either policy system as being generally flexible or rigid.

Infrastructure has different users. Transport and logistics link the producers to markets, technical facilities and knowledge, and are available in research centers and university laboratories. Firms' operating environment also includes information infrastructure and public services. The amount of expenditure cannot indicate the role played by investment or the way enterprises and researchers use it. These uses are related to public infrastructure and industrial renewal.

5.2. Industrial Diversification

Colorado's technology, energy, agriculture, and tourism sectors offer diversification as a broader array of production and services. Changes in existing industries are a parallel question for Northeast China. A new technology company introduces an activity or an improved manufacturer changes its existing production [11]. Both can contribute to a broader economy without requiring one principal industry to be replaced by another.

Agriculture and tourism broaden this comparison beyond manufacturing. Agricultural technology relates to productivity and to the value added through agricultural products. Forest, landscapes and winter recreation resources provide other types of tourism activities. For Northeast China, these are possible additional sources of income, products, and services, discussed alongside the technological renewal of heavy industry.

5.3. Private Investment and Innovation Resources

Incubators, accelerators, and industrial parks bring investment and research capacity together in the Colorado case. The best solutions for Northeast China are said to be start-up funding, investment incentives, entrepreneurship activities, and collaborations between private companies, universities, and research institutions. The arrangements join at varying stages between a research concept and commercial

manufacturing. Funding provides project resources, while technical cooperation determines what can be developed with them. Where the same business is faced with all three, market-entry and approval procedures are a separate issue. The relationship between external resources and local capabilities [12] is therefore examined through what firms learn, produce, and sell.

5.4. Clean Energy and Environmental Industries

The energy comparison is a measure of diversification in terms of the use of resources in production. Recycling and shifts in manufacturing processes impact materials and other inputs, while wind and solar energy remodel electricity supply. So, there are applications for environmental technology in current factories, and in other industries. The activities are classified in the green economy but operate at different points in the production chain.

Their environmental consequences also raise different questions. Resource efficiency refers to an issue of inputs, whilst strong sustainability refers to ecological functions that are irreplaceable [16–18]. The changes that a factory can make to its processes, its electricity supply, or its use of materials must be analysed with respect to the resources and environment that they impact. Industrial development alone does not establish environmental improvement.

6. Pathways for Economic Revitalization in Northeast China

6.1. Government Roles and Policy Coordination

In the Northeast China region, coordination makes national goals and local conditions come together in the same process of implementation. It also relates to enterprise assistance and public facilities as outlined in Section 5.1. Economic incentives and financial support influence the resources available to firms, while infrastructure and public services form part of the environment in which firms operate. Their relationship is not only between the levels of government, but also between types of support.

Timing presents a further issue. Firms base their decisions on arrangements that are likely to continue, but markets and technologies may change before research is put into commercial application. Policy adjustment and continuity therefore respond to different needs. The question is whether there is a connection between the instrument and the period of operation and the activity supported. This comparison does not prescribe an appropriate amount of assistance in advance.

6.2. Industrial Innovation and Technological Change

Northeast China's manufacturing capabilities give technological renewal a place within existing production. Changes in processes, efficiency, and product value can occur in established firms as well as new companies. University–industry cooperation and regional technology platforms connect this route with the application of research. Local learning and the transfer of scientific and technological achievements are relevant to how firms develop or adopt new techniques [8,12,15]. Artificial intelligence, new energy, and biotechnology provide the emerging-industry options considered alongside manufacturing renewal. The two routes

remain related through the practical task of putting research into production.

6.3. Regional Cooperation and International Experience

The Yangtze River Delta and the Guangdong–Hong Kong–Macao Greater Bay Area are considered as possible partners for exchanges of industrial and research experience. Cooperation can be in the field of technology, manpower, investment or commercial ties where international cooperation can expand access to foreign resources and markets. There are various ways of organizing those links in the form of research partnerships, investment, and industrial chain participation. Their relevance to Northeast China depends on the relationship between the resources obtained and the capabilities of local firms [12]. The Colorado comparison serves a similar analytical purpose by examining institutions together with the economic activities in which they participate.

6.4. Green Economic Activities and Sustainable Development

Northeast China's wind, solar, water, agricultural, and ecological resources provide the physical basis for the activities outlined in Section 5.4. The economic utilization of them also requires the capability of firms, services, research and technical facilities. This pathway relates to the creation and use of environmental technologies, which includes working with organisations outside the region. The resource-use and ecological criteria discussed above [16,17] remain part of that process: the availability of natural assets is a starting condition, not a completed environmental assessment.

7. Conclusion

The comparison links the process of industrial renewal in Northeast China with the development of activities outside of its traditionally established production base. Colorado's technology industries, renewable energy and tourism are examples of how research, funding and nature can be utilized. In Liaoning, Jilin and Heilongjiang, the pathways discussed are those that are relevant to how these resources are delivered to firms and how they are utilized in production. With respect to that task, public support and coordination, technological change, cooperation outside the region, clean energy and services are considered. The modernization of existing industries is still part of the equation – it is not an alternative to diversification.

This is a descriptive study without a uniform dataset to estimate the impact of policies for the two areas. It cannot determine that the Colorado (US) pattern would yield the same outcomes in Northeast China. The development options pinpoint relationships for evaluation in certain contexts but the economic and environmental implications have not been quantified here.

Acknowledgments

Heilongjiang Provincial Natural Science Foundation Joint Guidance Project (No. LH2021C056).

References

- [1] Zhang, Y. Y. (2019). Understanding profound changes unseen in a century. *International Economic Review*, (5), 12. (in Chinese)

- [2] Jin, B. (2017). China's industrial transformation and upgrading in the new era of globalization. *China Industrial Economics*, (6), 6. (in Chinese)
- [3] Chen, B. (2019). Challenges and responses of market regulation in the development of the digital economy: A discussion centered on data-related conduct. *Journal of Northeastern University (Social Sciences)*. (in Chinese)
- [4] Wang, Y., Lei, G. P., Liu, Z. J., et al. (2010). Analysis of the driving factors of sustainable land use in coal resource-exhausted cities. *Economic Geography*, 30(7), 1185–1188. (in Chinese)
- [5] Xu, Z. (2018). Transformation of China's monetary regulation approach at the stage of high-quality economic development. *Journal of Financial Research*, (4), 19. (in Chinese)
- [6] Yang, C. Y., Liu, X. C., Chen, D. P., & Zhang, Y. T. (2020). Medium- and long-term trends of the world economy amid profound changes unseen in a century. *Macroeconomics*, (8), 10. (in Chinese)
- [7] Ye, T. (2004). Sustainable development of regional economies and culturally pluralistic integration. *Academics*, (2), 12. <https://doi.org/10.3969/j.issn.1002-1698.2004.02.002>. (in Chinese)
- [8] Sun, T. (2020). Evaluation of the efficiency of scientific and technological achievement transformation in China's old industrial bases: Evidence from Northeast China. *China Soft Science*, (1), 7. (in Chinese)
- [9] Shi, Y. P., Zhao, L. M., & He, Y. (2012). The relationship between industrial structure and the urban-rural income gap: Based on panel data from the three northeastern provinces. *Journal of Northwest A&F University (Social Science Edition)*, 12(6), 6. (in Chinese)
- [10] Li, K., & Lin, B. (2017). Economic growth model, structural transformation, and green productivity in China. *Applied Energy*, 187, 489–500. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.apenergy.2016.12.061>.
- [11] Pipkin, S., & Fuentes, A. (2017). Spurred to upgrade: A review of triggers and consequences of industrial upgrading in the global value chain literature. *World Development*, 98, 536–554. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.worlddev.2017.05.013>.
- [12] Turkina, E., & Van Assche, A. (2018). Global connectedness and local innovation in industrial clusters. *Journal of International Business Studies*, 49, 706–728. <https://doi.org/10.1057/s41267-018-0145-4>.
- [13] Huo, G. Q., Yang, Y., & Zhang, G. P. (2017). Construction of a theoretical model of innovation-driven regional development in China under the new normal. *Science of Science and Management of S&T*, 38(6), 17. (in Chinese)
- [14] Ziemnowicz, C. (2020). Joseph A. Schumpeter and innovation. In E. G. Carayannis (Ed.), *Encyclopedia of creativity, invention, innovation and entrepreneurship* (pp. 1517–1522). Springer International Publishing. <https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-14960-6>.
- [15] Li, S., Gao, L., Han, C., Gupta, B., Alhalabi, W., & Almakdi, S. (2023). Exploring the effect of digital transformation on firms' innovation performance. *Journal of Innovation & Knowledge*, 8(1), 100317. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jik.2023.100317>.
- [16] Gutiérrez, M. C. (1996). The concept of weak sustainability. *Ecological Economics*, 17(3), 147–156. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0921-8009\(96\)80003-6](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0921-8009(96)80003-6).
- [17] Ott, K. (2003). The case for strong sustainability. In Greifswald's environmental ethics (pp. 59–64).
- [18] Dinda, S. (2004). Environmental Kuznets curve hypothesis: A survey. *Ecological Economics*, 49(4), 431–455. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolecon.2004.02.011>.
- [19] Colorado Office of Economic Development and International Trade. (n.d.). Advanced industries accelerator programs. Choose Colorado. Accessed September 28, 2026.
- [20] Xcel Energy. (n.d.). Colorado renewable energy plans & reports. Accessed September 28, 2026.
- [21] Colorado Office of Economic Development and International Trade. (n.d.). Bioscience. Choose Colorado. Accessed September 28, 2026.
- [22] Colorado Office of Economic Development and International Trade. (n.d.). Technology & information. Choose Colorado. Accessed September 28, 2026.
- [23] Colorado Tourism Office. (n.d.). Colorado: Official vacation guide. Accessed September 28, 2026.
- [24] CPC Central Committee and State Council. (2003, October 5). Opinions on implementing the strategy for revitalizing old industrial bases in Northeast China and other regions. *Zhongfa* [2003] No. 11. (in Chinese)
- [25] CPC Central Committee and State Council. (2016, April 26). Opinions on the comprehensive revitalization of old industrial bases in Northeast China and other regions. *State Council Gazette*, (13). (in Chinese)