Constructing Women of Martial Spirit through Translation: From the Thane’s Daughter to a Gallant Woman

Min He

1Central South University of Forestry Science and Technology, Changsha 410004, China
*Corresponding author: Min He, minhe2003@163.com

Abstract: A fad of cultivating Chinese women’s martial spirit was witnessed in late Qing China as a result of Chinese male elites’ effort to mobilize women in nation rejuvenation. Role models of female martial spirit were thus urgently needed. A prototypical woman of martial spirit was constructed by Lin Shu through translating The Thane’s Daughter, an imaginary history of lady Macbeth. Lin reframed the original from a tale about parenting to a biography of a self-constituting gallant woman. Also, the evil attributes of the heroine was deliberately covered, including her sinister appearance, her unfilial thoughts to her father and her ruthlessness to people surrounding her. Finally, features indicating her martial spirit were foregrounded, like masculinity, resoluteness and courage. To further highlight martial spirit, the translator established a contrast between martial spirit and gentleness. This paper therefore argues that translation, the media of introducing otherness may turn out to be a vehicle of self-imaging, especially when a certain image is desperately needed in the target culture.

Keywords: Women of martial spirit, Late Qing China, Translation, Otherness, Self-imaging.

1. Introduction

A contrast between gentleness (Wen) and bellicose qualities or martial spirit (Wu) existed in China for thousands of years. The former is glorified by literati while the latter is liable to be related with barbarians[1]. Confucianism’s priority of gentleness over martial spirit and Taoism’s preference for ‘non-action’ over ‘action’ led to prejudice on martial spirit. Such a bias was harshly criticized in late Qing China, with an unprecedented national crisis threatening China. The avid nation strengtheners and reformists who were influenced by Western theories like Darwinism and Spenser’s socialism, attributed the crisis to the physical weakness of the people and absence of concepts of competitiveness, progress and survival of the fittest[2]. Moreover, the Sino-Japanese War (1894-1895) utterly shocked and humiliated China as Japan was long subordinate to China. Chinese elites concluded that Western ideas including martial spirit and physical strength was a deciding factor of Japanese’s thriving[3].

A consensus on the importance of martial spirit was thus reached in late Qing China. Yan Fu (1854-1921), a prestigious translator, put forth the following qualities of new citizens: tallness, robustness, vigor, capacity to endure hardship, suitability for fighting. He further claimed that physical strength, intellect and morality were three indispensable factors to nation rejuvenation[1]. Tan Sitong (1865-1898), the reform martyr, held that dynamism (dong) outweighed passivity (jing), asserting that the love for dynamism led to Western hegemony while the preference for passivity caused Chinese decline[4]. Cai E (1882-1916), the republican hero, coined the term of ‘militarized citizenship’ (Jun Guomin) when urging a nation-wide martial spirit [5]. Another enthusiastic advocate of martial spirit, Liang Qichao (1873-1929) acclaimed martial spirit in his well-known On Martial Spirit (Lun Shangwu) and enriched the connotation of it [6]. Martial spirit, according to Liang (1902), included not only physical power but also mental power and will power. A connection between liberated, independent and physically-strong women and a viable nation was also established by avid nation strengtheners like Qiu Jin [7]. Cultivating martial spirit was thus included in the aims of women education. In line with this mania for martial spirit, writers of that time wrote many biographies of gallant women in Chinese history. Some extraordinary Western women like Madam Roland, Harriet Beecher Stowe and Florence Nightingale were also introduced into China as the role models for Chinese women. Lin Shu (1852-1924), the most productive and influential translator in late Qing, constructed numerous figures featured with courage, determination, iron-will and strength through translation, hoping that it may “振作士气爱国保种 (boost the morale and revive the race)” [8]. But the majority of these figures are male, with Gruoch, lady Macbeth in her girlhood being the only exception. She stands out from the other female figures translated by Lin Shu for her extraordinary fortitude, determination and ruthlessness. Gruoch aroused my particular interest and the paper would investigate how Lin Shu appropriated the protagonist in the original to his political ends.

2. Reconstructing Gruoch: From an evil-natured Girl to an Extraordinary Woman of Martial Spirit

The Thane’s Daughter was written by Mary Cowden Clarke (1809-1898), a noted Shakespearean scholar. She eulogized Shakespeare as a great instructor to young girls[9], asserting that Shakespeare’s female protagonists may enlighten parents in making decent women out of their daughters. Clarke (2009) believes that parents, especially fathers have profound influence on their daughters[10]. She created a series of accounts about the girlhood of some Shakespearean heroines, such as Portia, Desdemona and Lady
Macbeth. This series depicts the circumstances and influences surrounding the immature Shakespeare’s heroines, which might foster the germs of character recognized in the heroines after they grew up.

The Thane’s Daughter recounts the growth of Gruoch, lady Macbeth in her girlhood. Her mother, lady Gruoch, an ambitious and determined aristocrat, aspired to re-glorify her declining house. She dreamt of marrying a powerful and energetic nobleman to rejuvenate her house. Unfortunately, she was married to an old and meek thane. Extremely disappointed, lady Gruoch aspired to have a son, a male heir who could fulfil her ambition. The birth of Gruoch dashed her last hope and she died in despair shortly afterwards. Gruoch’s father, in sharp contrast, was gentle and kind. Benevolent as he was, he failed “to adminster wholesome instruction”[9] as he had noticed the evil nature budding in his daughter but did nothing to wipe it off. It is justifiable to say that his negligence partly caused Gruoch’s growth into lady Macbeth, the most villainous female character among Shakespearean heroines.

Obviously, the moral of Clarke’s story lies in that parents, especially fathers should be watchful to their daughters’ evil tendency and eliminate it at early stage. However, what arouses Lin Shu’s interest of this story may not be its moral but its heroine, the young Gruoch who is full of “firmness, self-command, enthusiasm, intellect, ardent affections”[9]. These features were rewritten into martial spirit, the very attribute absent in Chinese women. To construct a role model of female martial spirit, Lin reframed the original, replacing the theme from the importance of parenting to the significance of cultivating martial spirit in young girls. He also deliberately glossed over some evil attributes of Gruoch in fear of incurring aversions from Chinese readers. Gruoch’s traits indicating martial spirit were foregrounded like determination, fortitude, courage and iron-will. To highlight martial spirit, Lin even established a contrast between gentleness and martial spirit.

2.1. A changed theme

As mentioned, Lin Shu replaced the original theme from the criticality of parenting to a story of a self-constituting heroine with martial spirit, which is conspicuously embodied by the title of the translation. The author of The Thane’s Daughter intends to emphasize fathers’ impact on daughters. This may be illustrated by the titles of the series, like Portia: The Heiress of Belmont, Helena: The Physician’s Orphan, Desdemona: The Magnificent’s Child, with all of them indicating the heroines’ subordination to their patriarchs. Such subordination is eliminated in the title of the translated version, Biography of Gruoch, an extraordinary woman, where Gruoch is foregrounded as an independent individual. It must be pointed out that Lin Shu had never advocated female independence. As a faithful follower of Confucianism, Lin believes that women should be submissive and subordinated to men while strictly abiding the ‘three cardinal guides and five constant virtues’ (sangang wuchang). This may be illustrated by the heroines of his translation which are generally gentle, submissive and virtuous[11]. The independence endowed to Gruoch in the translation is thus remarkable, perhaps indicating Lin’s full awareness that independence is a precondition for cultivating martial spirit in women.

The appositive of Gruoch in the title, an extraordinary woman is also noticeable. Extraordinary women in Chinese traditional stories are generally well known for some outstanding traits like literary talents, superior martial arts, matchless intelligence or high morality. The title of the translated version may thus reveal the translator’s admiration to female martial spirit which was urgently needed in late Qing China. Finally, biography in the title is also worth noticing. Biography about women of martial spirit was one of the most popular genre in late Qing China as fostering martial spirit was prioritized in women education in line with the prevalent mania for martial spirit. Chinese women were criticized for not ‘warrior-like’ or ‘soldierly’[12]. Biography of gallant women was thus popularized to provide models for women to emulate. The modern Western women of martial spirit were particularly welcomed like Madame Rolland[13]. Lin Shu may be influenced by this fad and constructed such a model, which was noticeably indicated in the changed title.

2.2. Glossing over Gruoch’s evil thoughts and deeds

Lady Macbeth is a notoriously evil woman as she instigated Macbeth to murder the well-intended king Duncan and usurp the throne. Gruoch, the immature Lady Macbeth was accordingly depicted as a heartless girl. She despised her benevolent father as he was powerless and meek although he adored her absolutely. Her mercilessness is more obviously embodied through her attitude towards people surrounding her. Her nanny treated her as if she were her own daughter, but to her death, Gruoch was totally indifferent. Culen, her servant and childhood playmate, was passionately devoted to her and saved her at the cost of his own life, but Gruoch turned a blind eye to his sacrifice. Out of jealousy, Gruoch forced a singing girl into the snowstorm, which caused her death. All these evil deeds were deliberately glossed over by the translator in fear of incurring hatred of the readers.

Gruoch’s evil nature is indicated by her stunningly handsome but sinister appearance, as illustrated by the following quote:

Surpassingly handsome she was; but yet a look there was in those blue eyes, that married their loveliness of shape and colour; and seemed sinisterly to contradict their attractive power: In the mouth, too, round those full and rubious lips, and amid those exquisite dimples, there played certain lines that presented indications of a startling contrast of will and unfeminine inflexibility with so much charm of feature, which might have produced sensations of repulsive surmise to one accustomed to seek charm in expression rather than in linear beauty.

Gruoch’s sinister look, strong will and unfeminine inflexibility conform not to the standards of a Chinese beauty. Worse still, her unfeminine features may arouse repulsion from the readers. Lin Shu thereby deleted all these details, substituting them with vague adjectives like ‘beautiful’ ‘elegant’ and ‘handsome’[14].

Most of Gruoch’s thoughts and deeds violated Confucian doctrines, among which the most unforgivable one may be her...
lack of filial piety to her father. Just like her late mother, Gruoch dreamt of restoring the glory of her family, and was thus disappointed at her gentle and meek father. Disappointment bred disrespect. She would rather consult military knowledge from her father’s warriors than attending on her old father at home. One day, Gruoch encountered a prophet who predicted that an old person would die in her castle, which shocked her as her father was old and fragile. The abrupt threat of losing her father activated her love to father. She realized to her regret that she long neglected her father who had been yearned for her company. Such regret, however, is “vague, and dimly felt by her.” In translation the vaguely felt guilt was changed into deep remorse as Gruoch was fully conscious of her inappropriateness:

女外游时多, 定省时少, 然亦知父不侍其子又非当。故心中颇戚戚。

(Gruoch usually wanders outside and rarely pays respect to her father in the morning or in the evening. Yet, she knew that it was inappropriate to not attend her father when he was ill, so she felt uneasy and guilty.)

Gruoch’s abrupt affection to her father was activated by the threat of her father’s death. Such affection is, in essence, pity and compassion rather than respect and reverence. However, without respect and reverence, parents could hardly instruct their children properly. See the following quote:

Not pity and compassion, but respect and reverence, are the true guiding lights that should direct a child’s gaze to its parent, and that should shed a glory and a crowning beauty around a parent’s brow;— and it was the lack of these natural rays that darkened and abated the joy of love which should have arisen from Gruoch’s affection for her father.

Disrespect to her father is surely to incur readers’ aversion to Gruoch, as an unfilial daughter was by no means forgivable in late Qing China. Lin Shu thus deleted such details. Apart from disrespect, Gruoch harbored unspoken criticism to her father for she attributed the declining of her family to her father’s meekness, as illustrated by the following quote:

Patience encourages oppression. Submission courts fresh wrong. Contentment beneath such injuries shows like a crime. Would that the old man possessed my sense of inflicted evil, my spirit to resist it, my youth and activity to avenge and redress?

For Gruoch, her father’s patience, submission and contentment amount to crime as they invited humiliation. She even referred to her father as the old man, which reveals her contempt to her father. Disdain for one’s father is appalling to Chinese readers, so it was deleted:

If my father was like me then we could have restored our family; the more you retreat, the more likely you are to be bullied.

Gruoch’s harsh criticism to her father was rewritten into a pity on her father’s powerlessness and the universal principle of ‘good men get cheated’, which aligns with the fad for martial spirit in late Qing.

Due to the disrespect and contempt, Gruoch’s affection to her father is inevitably transient. With the threat of losing her father disappearing, she soon found staying with this meek and inactive old men unbearable. See the following quote:

But gradually the old restlessness returned; and Gruoch found the constant companionship of her parent as irksome as ever.

Her unwillingness of attending her father could not be translated faithfully; otherwise, she would be condemned as an ungrateful daughter. Lin Shu thus justified it with Gruoch’s courage. She merely hated to stay indoors:

Her courage was soon plucked up, so she was disinclined to remain indoors.

Lin Shu’s deliberate glossing over Gruoch’s unfilial thoughts and deeds was understandable because he, a typical Confucian scholar, strictly adhered to the Confucian doctrines, particularly filial piety. He spared no effort in advocating filial piety when translating Western literature. For example, he reframed The Dove in the Eagle Nest from a story of God’s omnipresent power to an extolment of filial piety [11]. The same strategy can be seen in his translation of Uncle Tom’s Cabin. Eve, an angle-like, naive girl, knowing she would soon die from illness, worried about her father. Therefore she told her father that she wished they two could go to the paradise together. Although such a naive thought is out of Eve’s strong affection to her father, Lin was concerned that such thought may arouse Chinese readers’ aversion and added Eve’s apology to her father [15]. Gruoch’s appalling unfilial thought may disqualify her as a role model of martial spirit, and was thus to be covered. Besides these unfilial thoughts and deeds, Gruoch’s heartlessness to those who loved her is also covered by the translator. Her wet nurse took good care of her after her mother’s death, adoring her as if she were her own child. Nevertheless, to the death of this faithful nurse, Gruoch was utterly indifferent. She even relieved because the doomed death fell upon her nanny instead of her father:

“Then hers was the death predicted!” thought Gruoch. And in the relief of finding it was not her father’s, that of the aged and faithful Bethoc was comparatively unfelt.

---

1 The Thane’s Daughter, p.117.
2 Biography of Gruoch, an extraordinary woman translated by Lin Shu & Chen Jialing, 1916, p.21, all the translation are mine unless otherwise noted.
3 The Thane’s Daughter, p.119-120.
4 The Thane’s Daughter, p.120.
5 The Thane’s Daughter, p.121-122.
6 Biography of Gruoch, p.23.
7 The Thane’s Daughter, p.118.
Lin Shu only translated Gruoch’s rejoice for her father but deleted her indifference to her nanny’s death.

The volition of the spirit made the passive body involuntarily fulfill its promptings, and move mechanically obedient to interior impulse. Consciousness and unconsciousness had equal possession of her frame, and dictated alike its motion.

Such slight uneasy, however, was rewritten into deep remorse in the translation. To intensify Gruoch’s remorse, Lin Shu even added a detail of Gruoch’s imaging Doada struggling on the snow covered road:

阻雪于道，自念发遣杜亚司之故，本以避马克倍司，顾以一己私情，全堕公道，天良萌动，颇跃悔其孟浪。

Lin Shu deleted Gruoch’s ecstasy of being suited while adding grief and guilt:

... a shadow of regret clouded her brow, for having so hastily sent the damsel forth. But the cloud was transient; the shade passed from her thought, as she turned beaming and gracious to the suitor at her side.

As analyzed, Lin Shu purified Gruoch before constructing her as a role model of female martial spirit. He deleted depiction of her sinister outlook and covered her evil thoughts and deeds. After such purification, Lin foregrounded Gruoch’s attributes of martial spirit.

2.3. Highlight the martial spirit in the original

Gruoch is indeed admirable in terms of courage. She is fearless confronted with bellicose invaders. With her baby in her arms, she entered the battlefield to boost the morale of Macbeth’s troop. No wonder Macbeth, the renowned hero stands in awe of his wife and calls her ‘mother of heroes’. Gruoch’s profound military knowledge, intelligence and calmness lends her a great helpmate to her husband who often consults her for military strategies. All these details are faithfully translated.

To further champion martial spirit and make the Chinese

10 Biography of Gruoch, p.22.
11 The Thane’s Daughter, p.165.
12 Biography of Gruoch, p.61.
13 The Thane’s Daughter, p.145.
14 Biography of Gruoch, p.44.
15 The Thane’s Daughter, p.148.
16 Biography of Gruoch, p.46.
grasp the importance of it, Lin Shu even created a conflict between martial spirit and gentleness which is absent in the original. Specifically, such a contrast is established through Gruoch and her mother’s aversions to all soft, amiable attributes like gentleness, meekness and benevolence. Gruoch’s late mother, Lady Gruoch is full of ambition, determination and fortitude, the very qualities that the thane lacks. This prevents her from loving her husband. The scarcity of intimacy between the couple, however, does not lead to dislike or defiance, as Lady Gruoch finds it hard to have an aversion to her husband who is so amiable and gentle. See the following quote:

But though the thane of Moray was little calculated to inspire love in her whom he had married, he was almost as little formed to excite so active a feeling as dislike for he was bland, kind, and gentle to a fault— at least in those times, when hardihood, courage, fortitude, activity, and the austere virtues more advantageously adorned a man than such qualities as distinguished the mild and benevolent Kenneth.

The translated version highlights the gentleness of the thane and rewrites Lady Gruoch’s lack of attachment to her husband into defiance.

A wife of late Qing China, a typical patriarchal society, was supposed to hold her husband in great esteem. Defiance from a wife is definitely a great humiliation to her husband. Rewriting in this way, therefore not only underscores the significance of martial spirit but also reveals the damaging consequence of gentleness, as it may shake the very foundation of patriarch. To contextualize the story to Chinese society, Lin Shu added that martial spirit is widely admired.

The thane’s lack of martial spirit, in Lin’s version, even provoked bitter criticism from his wife. In the original, Lady Gruoch’s aversion to gentleness. When Macbeth proposed to Gruoch he admitted that he was not a man of artful speech as he valued only royalty and bravery. Gruoch then chimed in: “I care little for poesy and song, ...”

Lin Shu, however, changed this into an evident distaste to literati:

“Of what use are these so-called virtues? ” said she. “Do they gain anything? Do they serve to win one high object? One single end worthy of attainment? Softness, sweetness, meekness, gentleness, and a whole tribe of these washy goodnsses, were only styled virtues by knaves who sought to take advantage of the easy prey which such a creed would produce them in its professors.

Such a statement is undoubtedly horrible in late Qing China as the long cherished kindness is devalued as nothing but a vehicle of cheating. Lin Shu therefore created a contrast between martial spirit and gentleness to justify Gruoch. In the translation, gentleness is indeed a virtue, but the great achievers should not to be confined by it. See the following translation.

The assertion that achievements based not on kindness and gentleness but on martial spirit aligns with late Qing China society, where the most urgent achievement is doubtlessly rejuvenating the nation. Lin’s rewriting thus well served his political purposes.

17. The Thane’s Daughter, p.98.
21. The Thane’s Daughter, p.147.
23. The Thane’s Daughter, p.128.
Gentleness and kindness, according to Gruoch, disqualified Duncan, the newly crowned king from ruling his country. He offered his hungry people empty prayers instead of food. Confronted with bellicose enemies, he resorted to laws and regulations rather than conquering them with force.

He seems to be too like his predecessor; who built churches, when he should have erected fortresses against the Danish intruders; gave his people public prayers to say, when he should have filled their hungry mouths; sent forth his book of Regia Majestas under pretence of wisely establishing laws and ordinances for the government of his realm, when he might have advanced their honor and glory by conquest and worthy achievement; and so got the name of sanctity, while he outraged all godliness by his avarice and his selfishness. Out upon such carpet virtues, which might shew well enough in a clerky monk, but be seem not a monarch, a Scottish sovereign!—And when, pray, is this gracious meekness, this milk-and-water amiability to be crowned?

Such lengthy condemnation is faithfully translated, which is quite conspicuous as Lin Shu tended to take great freedom in translating and paraphrasing the original. The extraordinary faithfulness may indicate Lin Shu’s intention to highlight the incompatibility between gentleness and mighty achievement.

3. Conclusion

The unprecedented national crisis in late Qing China bred a fad for martial spirit. Constructing martial spirit was accordingly prioritized in female education. A role model of female martial spirit was created through translation by Lin Shu, the patriotic translator as well as an avid nation strengthener. The protagonist in the original is a courageous, ambitious but heartless girl, which well explains her formation into Lady Macbeth, the most malicious Shakespearean heroine. Her courage and fortitude were highlighted while her evil attributes were deliberately glossed over in the translation. To contextualize her into Chinese late Qing society, Lin Shu deleted all the details of her unfilial thoughts and deeds. He also rewrote some plots to tune down the cruelty of Gruoch. The morally purified heroine was then qualified to serve as a role model of female martial spirit. Most importantly, a sharp contrast between martial spirit and gentleness was established to foreground the criticality of the former as a contributing factor to the thriving of a nation. The moral of the original, the importance of parental instruction is accordingly prioritized in female education. A role model of martial spirit. Constructing martial spirit was consequently changed into an advocacy of martial spirit. This study may well illustrate a growing recognition that translation is inventive. Translation, in essence, is a journey of two orientations. On the one hand, alien images travel afar from foreign culture to enrich the targeted culture. On the other hand, the foreign images are rewritten, reshaped and reframed into the targeted culture to construct an ideal image of self. This, in turn, illuminates the immense culture-formation power of translation.

Acknowledgment

This paper is funded by the Department of Education of Hunan Province, China: “Modern literary translation and the construction of female images: From late Qing Dynasty to the May 4th Movement”. The project number is 20C1900.

References


25 The Thane’s Daughter: p.128-129.